

Jason Boursier
EDCI 672
10/19/2024

Key Stakeholders and Their Interests

a. List of Stakeholders and Their Roles:

🕒 **Paul Lindley** (Designer/Professor)

- Role:** Lead instructional designer and professor guiding the project.
- Interests/Concerns:** Developing a game to be used in high-school social studies that is engaging and relevant to controversies of today. He wants the learning objectives defined, the choices and goals of the character's defined, and what the constraints and resources are for the project.

🕒 **Graduate Students:**

Kevin Elkin (Gamer/Instructional Designer)

- Role:** Graduate student with more gaming experience than the group.
- Interests/Concerns:** Incorporating engaging gameplay mechanics, using ideas from sandbox and role-playing games. He wants students to immerse themselves in the environment and learn what it's like in the camps.

Linda Grimes (Library Science Student/ Instructional Designer)

- Role:** Graduate student and ID with fair amount of gaming experience.
- Interests/Concerns:** Interviewed teachers to find out why they use games, how they use them and what their goals are, and if they are

teaching about the camps in their classrooms. Able to research SMEs like historians to get accurate information for projects.

Sun-Young Lim (Former Teacher)

Role: Graduate student and ID and non-gamer.

Interests/Concerns: Tasked to understand how students are engaged best with educational games, what the resources of the teachers are.

Found that if learners identify with the main character, they will be able to most likely see their point of view.

Bo Chen (Former Teacher)

Role: ID and Grad student with online card game experience only.

Interests/Concerns: Aligning the game with state and nationwide standards and making it accessible depending on device/internet speed.

Wants to incorporate the “big decisions” people in the camp make like how they decide if to swear loyalty to the country that imprisoned them and forced them to liquidate their assets.

Bob Reckowsky (Client/Principal)

Role: Principal of the alternative high school and client for the game.

Interests/Concerns: Wants to keep his track record of using project-based learning and limited resources to turn around failed public high-school kids. He developed a module that examined the internment of Japanese Americans during WWII and how baseball helped build morale, so he could be considered a

partial SME but he is very busy and may not have time to be involved in project extensively.

🕒 **Teachers and Students at the Alternative High School** (Audience)

- ❑ **Role:** End-users of the game, but there will be other schools in the future that will use the game.
- ❑ **Interests/Concerns:** For teachers, resources that don't take much time because of the testing standards but something they can use for either in-class or homework; for students, content that isn't boring and that connects to their current educational experience.

Instructional Design Challenges and Case-Specific Constraints

a. Key Instructional Design Challenges:

- **Challenge 1:** A key challenge will be to design the game within the allotted time while keeping it engaging with character-building gameplay. The game must also include learning objectives that connect students to current events about democracy, all while ensuring the content is free of anything offensive or that could violate state or federal standards—and, of course, without upsetting any parents.
 - **Description:** The subject matter is sensitive and may not naturally lend itself to being engaging in open world play similar to games like Grand Theft Auto without the addition of violent content. There will need to be a balance between allowing students to be immersed in this environment while still adhering to state and federal standards

- **ID Process Stage:** Design and Development phases of the ADDIE model.
- **Challenge 2:** The team's challenge will be to align their varied skill sets and agree on how to implement the game, so it is both educational and entertaining, while also meeting state-enforced curriculum goals. Additionally, the team must understand the constraints teachers face in delivering quick lessons across a broad range of social studies topics, often with limited time and student resources, such as access to laptops, iPads, or reliable internet at home.
 - **Description:** There are limitations to what content will be allowed to be in the game and the degree to which students can experience the real trauma of the internment camp detainee. Deciding the time students will have to play the game is critical, so the design team will have to stay focused on adhering to the learning objectives. What do they want the learners to experience in relation to the limitations of content? What is the most depraved experience the team can show in the game without being too offensive to parents or administrators who don't want to risk playing politics?
 - **ID Process Stage:** Analysis phase, specifically needs assessment and learner analysis.

b. Case-Specific Challenges Impacting Design:

- **Limited Experience and Sensitive Content:**
 - Graduate students (IDs) have limited experience designing games, let alone ones that need to align sensitive issues to current issues.

- o The team of IDs will need to agree how to proceed with the type of game, content in game, and external content to support game like teacher's guides.
- **Limited time for teachers (audience) to incorporate into lessons:**
 - o The team will need to design a game that educates and has an impact in supporting current social studies state-mandated curriculum or will have difficulty being adopted.
- **Multiple Ethical and Educational Considerations:**
 - o The game will need to balance staying accurate and handling sensitive topics like racial slurs and how they make the characters feel, and how they incorporate controversial slang and/or coping mechanisms like gambling into the game.
 - o Deciding how to educate students on issues that connect to their lives in the present tense while adding entertainment into the game like baseball, like how hunting was added to The Oregon Trail Game to coincide with the story of traveling down the trail.

Prioritization of Challenges

Priority List:

- 1. The designer will have to understand the needs of the audience (teachers and students) and develop effective learning objectives:**
 - a. Clear learning goals will help guide the design process after analysis of the teachers needs to be effective and not be too lengthy, unless it helps with

standardized tests, and the students need to have the game be entertaining and educational.

2. Aligning content with educational standards:

- a. When drawing out the storyboard for the game, the designers will need to ensure the game is relevant to current curriculum and therefore usable by teachers in not simply alternative schools, but all high schools. They will need to consult with the SMEs like Bob and other historians and teachers to develop the structure of an acceptable storyline.

3. Address team knowledge gaps:

- a. With a short timeline to produce a storyboard, the team needs to play to each other's strengths and decide what core agreements they have to move forward on the project, based on the preliminary research.

4. Design engaging gameplay mechanics:

- a. The gameplay needs to be finalized, and the team must decide whether to incorporate current events directly into the game or if it would be more effective to address these connections in the supplemental materials.

5. Navigating ethical considerations:

- a. The team will need to decide whether the content will take a strong stance or remain more neutral, while considering both the perspective of the internment detainee and the fearful nationalist wanting to protect their land from attack. The sensitive topic of racism in America must be carefully addressed. The team should focus on portraying the detainee's experience without appearing biased

solely against the oppressive regime, given the game's U.S. audience. Using baseball as a central theme could help, allowing topics like immigration and racism to be explored more subtly, making the game more appealing to a wider audience.

6. Resource and time management:

- a. The team needs to focus on the strategy for implementation to adhere to universal design principles so all students can have access, without taking away from the short amount of time they have to learn how to incorporate the game into standardized curriculum.

Explanation:

- Understanding the audience and defining clear learning objectives are foundational to the project. Without this, the project will struggle to take off.
- After a detailed analysis using the Dick and Carey Model, it's crucial to ensure the game aligns with the teacher's current curriculum and workload. This will help define the scope and depth of the game, ensuring agreement among stakeholders.
- Any knowledge gaps within the team must be addressed so each member can focus on their area of expertise, avoiding conflicts as the project progresses. Roles should be clearly defined once the objectives and learner analysis are established.
- Next, the gameplay mechanics must be finalized to allow the content to be fully designed once the learning goals and team capabilities are clearly defined. Each team

member will focus on a specific area, contributing to the development of the storyboard and the final production of the game.

- As content is developed, ethical considerations must be continually assessed and integrated, ensuring a balance between the needs of the principal and teachers to communicate a relevant message within the game. The narrative should convey the trauma of being forcibly removed from one's home in connection to a horrific event, drawing parallels to hate crimes against immigrants where leaders and politicians fuel fear and reprisals—essentially saying it without explicitly stating it. By humanizing the characters, students can immerse themselves in the difficult decisions these families faced, while processing the emotional weight of these experiences through gameplay, such as baseball or gambling.
- Resource and time management is an ongoing concern and if the game can be played across multiple platforms in an efficient and engaging way, then this problem can be addressed throughout the design process.

Reflection on Readings and Previous Experiences

Readings:

- **Sensitive and controversial issues in the classroom:**
 - **Contribution:** The research of Kello (2016) was extremely useful in determining possible solutions for the Lindley case because of the examination of social and controversial issues (SCIs) from the perspective of the teachers to determine

specific motives behind the various strategies. From this research, I can determine a specific model for the game to align with the various perspectives. The designed game could be made to enhance the idea of the history teacher's role as "finding common ground" and "smoothing edges, and "leaving the truth open" to teach students to be more patient and tolerant of each other (Kello, 2016, p. 43), as opposed to "just doing the job" or "hiding and avoiding."

- **Designing and integrating purposeful learning in game play:**
 - **Contribution:** The research of Ke (2015) helps with the project because of the various specific options laid out to determine the exact strategy for incorporating effective education within the gameplay. From this text I can suggest a solution to incorporate the various themes of the article so the team can consider how the game will activate knowledge, whether the learning will be from the game mechanics or the world of the game, how moments of meta-reflection will be mixed in, and what types of in-game learning support there will be. These specifics will be in-laid after the team determines if the game will be a "drill and practice" educational game, an entertainment game (with learning as a side-effect) or a construction game (like SimCity), and how the narrative of the internment camp detainee will be interwoven within the gameplay.

Previous experiences:

- **Experience with history being aligned with the present:**

- o **Influence:** I have gained valuable insights from my mother, who is deeply involved in immigration issues and has authored several books on detainees in ICE detention camps. She used art therapy to help detainees cope with their experiences. She has also participated in demonstrations alongside Japanese internment camp survivors, protesting the detention of children in ICE camps. This connection has made me keenly aware of the importance of teaching empathy. This aligns with Freire's (2018) concept of 'conscientization'—the development of critical awareness. Education can guide teachers to help students reflect on their own critical incidents and the impact on their lives, fostering social change and a sense of shared responsibility within their communities. The game can serve as a platform to give a voice to the voiceless.
- **Background in gaming:**
 - o **Influence:** I have been an avid gamer since childhood and grew up in the 1980s to witness the evolution of gaming. I recently got back into gaming during COVID and understand the various types of games, and what keeps me interested (social gameplay, leveling up, etc.).

Two Possible Solutions/Recommendations

Solution 1: Develop an open-world, entertainment type game with meta-reflection

- **Description:** Design a game structure with an open-world format that allows players to experience the tough choices faced by both the men and women stripped of their

homes and living at the camp, as well as those tasked with detaining the prisoners. The game will explore the difficult decisions detainees and prison guards must make, offering a balanced perspective. To maintain engagement, there will be pauses for reflection that don't disrupt the flow of gameplay. Additionally, elements of baseball can be woven into the game to keep it entertaining between the heavy decisions and choices the players will need to make.

- **Addressed Challenges:**

- **Understand learning objectives:** Seek consensus from teachers that the goal is to "find common ground" by teaching this topic from multiple perspectives, rather than focusing solely on the detainees. Ensure the meta-reflective activities in the game connect to real-world issues, encouraging learners to foster positive change in their own communities.
- **Aligning content with educational standards:** The meta-reflective activities within the game will reflect key knowledge that students need to learn from their social studies curriculum. This way, the main points from current lessons are reinforced in the game, ensuring alignment with educational standards and addressing ethical concerns.
- **Designing engaging gameplay:** There will be elements of baseball within the game once certain missions are completed by the multiple characters to help the entertainment value and hold engagement, similar to the hunting gameplay included in The Oregon Trail game of old.

- **Pros:**

- Allows for multiple viewpoints within the game.
- Addresses the core learning objectives while still being entertaining.
- Encourages the team to utilize their limited background and resources.
- **Cons:**
 - The gameplay may be disrupted by too much meta-reflection.
 - Open world format games may require more development resources.
 - By being open-world and not module based, the learners may become distracted and unable to focus on the learning objectives.

Solution 2: Design an educational game with narrative-driven gameplay without sensitive content

- **Description:** Rather than an open-world format, the gameplay should be in modules and narrative-driven, allowing players to make decisions that influence the outcome of the game. Focus on one or two main characters, guiding the player through various choices, like a graphic novel. Reward good decisions with power-ups and impose penalties for poor choices, creating a more immersive and engaging experience.
- **Addressed Challenges:**
 - **Learning objectives will be met:** The learner will be carried through the narrative without distractions of an open world game environment.
 - **Ethical considerations:** Avoids sensitive content while still being engaging.

- **Engaging gameplay:** The content will be linear with an active storyline, so an exact story can be drawn out by the team and there will be more cohesion and ability to stick to a deadline once everyone understands their roles.
- **Pros:**
 - Will be a more structured game with a clear beginning, middle and end. Will align with Kello's (2016) notion of "leaving the truth open" for players to interpret.
 - There will be more control for the designers over the length of the game to achieve the learning objectives and appease the needs of the audience.
 - More accessible to a wider audience without having sensitive content.
- **Cons:**
 - May become boring to play repeatedly if there is one plot line that players need to overcome each time to move through the levels.
 - Risk of the client feeling the game doesn't allow learners to feel the impact of their decisions in the game without the sensitive content.
 - Less options for characters may make the game appear biased or trying to force a view on the audience.

Final Recommendation

Chosen Solution: Solution 2 – Design and educational game with narrative-driven gameplay without sensitive content

Justification:

- **Alignment with Learning Objectives:** Enables specific learning objectives to be met within time constraints, using a drill-and-practice and educational approach to highlight the difficult decisions detainees faced. This focused structure ensures the game aligns with the client's goals, providing a clear path to achieving the desired outcomes.
- **Flexibility:** Designed to accommodate a variety of classroom environments, ensuring it isn't excluded from mainstream schools due to sensitive content. While the client may have concerns, this approach can be marketed as having broader mass-market appeal, helping to spread the primary message more effectively. Instead of pushing teachers to present multiple perspectives, the game allows the truth to remain open to interpretation, avoiding accusations of bias or promoting a specific agenda.
- **Educational impact while being entertaining:** Balances educational impact with entertainment by encouraging deeper engagement through a narrative-driven approach, avoiding the distractions of an open-world format. Content can incorporate language from the current curriculum and input from SMEs. For example, after completing each narrative module, players can engage in a short game of baseball to provide a break from the complex themes and character portrayals, helping to prevent cognitive overload for those who might find the material overwhelming.

Addressing Cons:

- **Overcoming boredom:** Integrate the game of baseball into the module for fun beyond the educational content.

- **Lack of sensitive content not making an impact:** The team will inform the client that this approach will broaden the game's appeal to a wider audience while reducing the risk of placing teachers in uncomfortable positions. Core issues and decisions will still be addressed, but without the use of racial slurs or provocative violence. Supplemental materials can cover these topics in more depth, providing students with the information they need to reflect on how the game's content relates to their own lives.
- **Less options for characters:** To avoid the appearance of bias, the instigating factors behind the decision to start the internment camps will be discussed before incorporating the game into the lessons. This approach allows both perspectives to be addressed without incorporating them directly into the gameplay. It will help students stay focused, reduce the time needed to complete the game, and ensure the learning objectives are met efficiently.

References

Ertmer, P. A., Glazewski, K. D., Koehler, A. A., & Stefaniak, J. E. (2024). *The ID CaseBook : Case Studies in Instructional Design*. (6th ed.). Taylor & Francis Group.

Freire, P. (2018). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (M. B. Ramos, Tran.; 50th anniversary edition.). Bloomsbury Academic.

Kello, K. (2016). Sensitive and controversial issues in the classroom: Teaching history in a divided society. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 22(1), 35-53.

<https://DOI.org/10.1080/13540602.2015.1023027>

Ke, F. (2016). Designing and integrating purposeful learning in game play: a systematic review. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 64(2), 219–244.

<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-015-9418-1>